TRIPURA HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION KUNJABAN: AGARTALA <u>PIN – 799006</u>

Complaint No. 60 of 2024

Uma Banik Vs <u>O/C Srinagar Police Station</u>.

FINAL ORDER Dated, 19th of December-2024

On 29/07/2024 the complainant Smt. Uma Banik (Das), w/o Sri Amar Das of Nagicherra, Kathiababa Ashram Para submitted a complaint, stating inter alia that she lodged a complaint against one Raju Ghosh, a neighbor of her house, who used CCTV camera with surveillance to the living room, verandah, bathroom, kitchen and toilet of the complainant most illegally and was capturing pictures of the complainant during her bathing and working in the kitchen and house. The said activities were made very illegally and without the knowledge of the complainant. It is alleged that CCTV camera was installed in the house of Rajib Ghosh one month back, but the complainant came to know very recently that Sri Rajib Ghosh captured so many pictures of the complainant during her bath and also took pictures during her changing of clothes, daily works and also monitored conversation between complainant and her It is apprehended that the said Raju Ghosh husband. might cause damage to the social reputation and family reputation of the complaint. After her complaint, O/C Srinagar PS took her information over telephone but no action was taken from the PS. She has been facing a great problem from the CCTV camera installed in the house of Rajib Ghosh. It is also alleged that on her repeated requests, Srinagar PS did not register any specific case in

Page 1 of 10

the PS. She claimed that she also enclosed photos of CCTV camera along with her complaint to the O/C Srinagar PS seeking action. Considering the allegation made in the complaint, the Commission viewed that the copy of the complaint should be sent to the Superintendent of Police, West Tripura to inquire into the allegation and to submit a response in writing within 3(three) weeks.

2. The Commission received a report from the office of the DGP, Tripura which was communicated by AIGP (Crime). Report of the AIGP (Crime) reads as follows:

"To

The Secretary, Tripura Human Rights Commission, Kunjaban, Agartala.

Subject: - Order of the Tripura Human Rights Commission dated 29" July, 2024 in connection with complaint no.60 of 2024.

Sir,

Please refer to the letter of Tripura Human Rights Commission, Kunjaban, Agartala vide No.THRC/3309 dated 30/07/2024 on the subject cited above.

02. The matter was enquired into and a detailed report has been furnished by the Superintendent of Police (West), Tripura, Agartala. The petitioner namely, Smt. Uma Banik Das submitted a complaint against Sri Rajib Ghosh, neighbour of the complainant, alleging that Rajib Ghosh had installed CCTV cameras in his house for keeping surveillance on her. The CCTV cameras cover her living room, 'verandah', bathroom, kitchen and toilet. He has been illegally capturing the pictures of the complainant during bathing and working in the kitchen and house. The complainant recently came to know that Rajib Ghosh had captured so many pictures while she was taking bath and changing clothes, during her daily activities in the house, during conversation with her husband etc. She opined that Sri Rajib Ghosh might use the CCTV pictures to damage the social reputation and family reputation of the complainant, Uma Banik Das.

03. On receiving the complaint, the fact was noted in GD vide Srinagar Ps GDE No. 12 dated 06-08-2024 and OC Srinagar PS took up its enquiry. During enguiry. OC Srinagar PS along with staff including women staff Visited the alleged place located at Kathiyababa Ashram Para, back side of TATA Motors under Srinagar PS There is an under construction farm house of Dr. Rajib Ghosh, Deputy Director.

Agriculture HRC Nagicherra and nearby there is yet another farm house of Sri Balaram Shil, retired DIG of CRPF. The complainant's dwelling hut made by GCI sheet is situated on the east side of Dr Reib Gh0sh's under construction farm house.

04. During enquiry, OC Sinagar PS discussed with local people and also examined somne labours of the under construction farm house and recorded their statements in connection with the aforementioned GD Entry and took photographs and videos of the entire place in the interest of the enquiry.

05. It has surfaced that Sri Raiib Ghosh S/o Lt. Santimoy Ghosh is permanently residing at Krishnanagar, Agartala. He is workina as the Deputy Director, Agriculture HRC Nagicherra. 5 (five) years ago he had purchased a plot of land at Kathiyababa TK. Ashram Para vide Khatian No. 4308, RS Plot No. 6650/11418 under Srinagar tk. About 7/8 months before, Rajib Ghosh started construction work of a building at Kathiyababa Ashram Para on his own land.

06. OC Srinagar PS has checked the under construction farm house and the store room of Sri Rajib Ghosh but no CCTV camera has been found at the said place. There is no electricity connection either at the said farm house. During enquiry, it is also learnt that a land dispute is going on in between the complainant, Uma Banik Das and Sri Rajib Ghosh & Balaram Shil which is in Trial stage before the Ld. Court of Judicial Magistrate 1 Class, Court No. 1, Agartala, West Tripura vide case No.CR- 48 of 2024.

07. Under the above fact and circumstances, it has transpired that the allegation against Sri Rajib Ghosh regarding installing of CCTV cameras for surveillance of the living room, bathroom, kitchen and toilet of the complainant, Uma Banik Das I baseless.

This is for information and doing the needful please".

3. Upon considering the report submitted by the AIGP (Crime), the Commission considered it appropriate to send the extract of the report to the complainant for her comments, if any, in writing, before the Commission. The complainant on 07/09/2024 appeared before this Commission and submitted her response in writing in respect of the report received from the AIGP (Crime) from the office of the DGP, Tripura and the response/comments of the complainant reads as follows:

"TO

THE CHAIRPERSON TRIPURA HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION KUNJABAN, AGARTALA

COMPLAINANT NO 60 OF 2024 COMPLAINANT: - UMA BANIK(DAS)

SUBJECT: - Comnents on the report submitted by AIGP (Crime) for DGP, Tripura.

SIR,

In reference to the subject settled above the complainant beg to submit the following lines for kind consideration of the commissioner:-

1. That, from the report it reveals that OC Srinagar P.S took up the inquiry vide GD NO. 12 dated 06/08/2024 and also visited the Spot. From this report it is not found that the OC Srinagar P.S. on which date visited the spot and also not mention it any line that the OC met with the complainant and also to visit the house of the complainant to find out the actual true of the complaint.

2. That in the report it is not clearly mention the surrounding area of survillenance of the specified CCTV Camera. OC Srinagar P.S. very intentionally did not mention above any inquiry of the hard disk of the said CCTV Camera to find out the surveillance of that camera.

3. That, OC Srinagar also mention a case which is filed by the complainant vide case no. CR 48 OF 2024 in the said case OC Srinagar very intentionally submitted a report to the court mentioning that the complainant filed the case only to harassedthe reputated persons that the accused of the said case. Is it mentioned here that the inquiry report submitted by the OC Srinagar P.S is suffering from biased and also has some relation with the accused person.

Therefore it is prayer that the Honorable Commission may kindly direct the Cyber crime cell of P.S West to inquiry the issues and to submit a final report with the comments on examination of the hard dise of the CCTV Camera under the surveillance of the complainant home and house.

Honorable commission may also kindly be pleased to direct the said inquiry teams to the inquiry the issues in presence of the complainant along with her One(1) person having the knowledge on the said process of Computer." 4. Considering the allegations made in the complaint and in the response received from the complainant and also considering the response of the superior authority of police, the Commission decided that the matter should be inquired by the Investigation Wing of the Commission, headed by Dy.SP, Sri Lalhim Molsom. Accordingly, the in charge of the Investigation Wing of the Commission submitted his investigation report on 18/11/2024. Conclusion of the report of the Investigation Wing reads as follows:

"CONCLUSION:

During inquiry based on all available evidences on records the following facts has been established:-

 One Smt. Uma Banik Das W/Oo Sri Amar Das of Nagicherra, near Kathiya Baba Ashram Para PS Srinagar is the complainant of instant case. In the year 2022, the complainant purchased approx 3% ganda of land in Kathia Baba Ashram from Ex-DIG of CRPF namely Balaram Shil and has been living in the said house since the year 2023 with her 2nd husband.

2. Sri Rajib Ghosh is a permanent resident of Krishnanagar, Agartala.He and his family members live in Agartala. On 04.01.2024 he has purchased a plot of land total 8 gandas at Kathia Baba Ashram Para vide khatian No-4308, RS plot No-6650 /11418 under Srinagar TK officially from Ex-DIG of CRPF namely Balaram Shil for the purpose of building a farm house. Rajib Ghosh is a Govt. employee, retired from Agriculture, Department, Nagicherra office as Deputy Director of Agriculture and he was reappointed in the same Deptt. Sri Rajib Ghosh visits his farm house to inspect and advice the laborers when construction work is

Page 5 of 10

3.5

undertaken, other than that he seldom visits nor stay in his farm land.

- 3. When Rajib Ghosh was about to construct his farm land boundary wall at that time Smt. Uma Banik Das told him that there are T Pillars under her boundary and it should not get damaged and not to touch the Pillars, if any damage is done, he has to pay compensation. So, Rajib Ghosh constructed his boundary wall with approx space roughly one or two inch from the fenced (barbed wire) of complainant. Even then the complainant is still unhappy with Rajib Ghosh.
- 4. Inside the farm land of Sri Rajib Ghosh there is a small store room made of GCI sheet with one door adjacent to the complainant house with temporary electric connection and on the other side is farm house which is under construction.
- 5. The complainant alleged that on 7th/8th of July 2024, the complainant came to know that a CC Camera was installed at store room made of GCI Sheet at Rajiv Ghosh land and noticed that Camera installed facing towards her house so that everything she was doing in the house was being captured on camera. The complainant also sent a written complaint through registered post address to O/C Srinagar Police Station reporting all the incidents but till now the Police of Srinagar PS had not investigated about the matter nor visited her house.
- 6. It is not a fact that O/C Srinagar PS did not inquire into the complaint of Smt. Uma Banik Das. O/C Srinagar received her complaint through registered post which was entered in Srinagar PS vide GDE No.12 at 1205 hrs dated 06.08.2024 and O/C PS conducted local enquiry vide Srinagar PS GDE No. 13 at 1220 hrs dated 06.08.2024. During inquiry 0/C Srinagar PS physically visiting the under construction farm house, store room of Sri Rajib Ghosh, but there was no CCTV cameras found installed. Even no

electric line connection was found available of on the said farm house at that time.

6. The workers of Sri Rajib Ghosh cannot go to his under construction land because Smt. Uma Banik Das rudely abuses them. Once Sri Rajib Ghosh took his wife to saw his farm house at that time also Smt. Uma Banik Das used foul language against Sri Rajib Ghosh. Not only Rajib but the complainant often uses abusing language against the local public passing by the side of Sri Rajib farm land. It is also to be mention here that Sri Rajib Ghosh had stop visiting and other works in his farm land after coming to know about the complaint of Smt. Uma Banik Das in Tripura Human Rights Commission against him.

7. The Investigation Wing inquired into the complaint of Smt. Uma Banik Das by visiting her house at Kathia Baba Ashram Para dated 08.10.2024 and had taken some still photos of the alleged PO i.e store room of Sri Rajib Ghosh from her house complex but could not find any CCTV Camera. The investigation wing with Inspector Dilip Debbarma /C Srinagar PS again jointly visited the farm land of Sri Rajib Ghosh dated 30.10.2024 and thoroughly check all the store

room, farm house but could not find any evidence of installation of CCTV camera in any part of the building. Neighbors of Smt. Uma Banik Das were consulted and examined in c/w the inquiry. From their statements it is transpired that No CCTV camera had been installed in Rajib Ghosh farm house. It is further revealed that

the complainant has a bad relation with her neighbors who often quarrels with them for no reason and started filling cases against them. She complained against Sri Rajib Ghosh, Sri Balaram Shil and 5 others before the Ld. court of Judicial Magistrate 1st Class, Court No-01 Agartala, West Tripura vide case No- CR 48 of 2024. On 16.08.2024 the Ld. Court discharged all the accused persons namely Balaram Shil, Rajib Ghosh, Baby Deb, Smt. Ganga Saha, St. Sumitra Roy, Babli Malakar and Mani Saha as no merit in the submission of the complainant side (the copy of order sheet enclosed herewith).



Page 7 of 10

8. Inspector Dilip Debbarma 0/C Srinagar PS in his statement dated 30.10.2024 mentioned that on 28.10.2024 one Babi Dutta had submitted written complaint by one Babi Dutta with 41 others (women) local public of Nagicherra, Kathia Baba Ashram Para against Smt. Uma Banik Das to O/C Srinagar PS, to the effect the Local Public are unhappy for the various activities of Uma Banik Das for the past one year. Smt. Uma Banik Das don't obey any words or decisions or orders of local elders, Panchayet, Mondols, Morchas or even any social organization. The said women are involved in various anti social activities. This complaint entered in GD vide Srinagar PS GDE No. 18 dated 28.10.2024.

9. In conclusion after through inquiry into the complaint of Smt Uma Banik Das it is transpired that the allegation made against Sri Rajib Ghosh regarding of CCTV camera with the surveillance to the living room, bathroom, kitchen and toilet of the complainant illegally and capturing pictures of the complainant while bathing, changing clothes etc. is totally found baseless.

Submitted to the Honorable Chairperson and the members of the Commission through the Secretary, Tripura Human Rights Commission, Kunjaban, Agartala for favour of kind perusal and doing needful please".

5. The Commission considered the entire matter and did not find any ground to disbelieve its own Investigation Team. It is clear from the report that the allegation made against Sri Rajib Ghosh regarding use of CCTV with surveillance of bathroom, living room, kitchen, toilet etc. illegally and capturing pictures of the complainant while bathing, changing clothes etc. are totally baseless. Rather, it was revealed that one Baby Datta has submitted a written complaint along with 41 others of Nagicherra area,

who were all women, to the effect that local people were unhappy for various activities of Uma Banik (Das) for the past one year and Smt. Banik did not obey any works or decisions of the local elders, Panchayats, Mandals, Morchas etc. or even social organization and she is involved in various anti social activities. The aspect of allegations of Baby Datta and 410thers are totally outside the matter of this Commission. But from the report, it appeared that the Investigation Wing inquired into the complaint of the complainant by visiting her house at Kathiababa Ashram Para on 08/10/2024 and had taken some still photos of the alleged PO, i.e. the store room of Rajib Ghosh from her house complex, but could not find any CCTV camera. The Investigation Wing along with Inspr. Dilip Debbarma of Sri Nagar PS again jointly visited the farm house land of Rajib Ghosh on 30/10/2024 and thoroughly checked all the store room, farm house but did not find any evidence of installation of CCTV camera in any part of the building. Neighbors of the complainant were consulted and examined and from their statements it transpired that no CCTV cameras were installed in the farm house of Rajib Ghosh. Rather, it revealed that complainant had a bad relationship with neighbors and often quarreled with them. She keeps the habit of lodging cases against her neighbors. Once, she complained against Rajib Ghosh, Balaram Shill and 5 others before the Ld. Court of the Judicial Magistrate, 1st Class, Court No. 1, Agartala, which was registered as CR 48 of 2024 and on 16/08/2024, the Ld. Court also discharged all the accused

persons namely, Balaram Shill, Rajib Ghosh, Smt. Baby Deb, Smt. Ganga Saha, Smt. Sumitra Roy, Smt. Babli Malakar and Smt. Mani Saha as there was no merit in the submission of the complainant's side and copy of the same was also enclosed.

6. The Commission on careful consideration of the report of its Investigation Wing is satisfied that the allegations of the complaint have got no merit and there is no need to proceed further with this inquiry. Accordingly, the inquiry of this Commission is hereby closed, finding no merit in the complaint of the complainant.

Accordingly inform the complainant.

On leave (S.C. Das) Chairperson

19/12/24 (U.Choudhuri) Member